UN Regional Commissions
Global Survey on Trade Facilitation and Paperless Trade Implementation

Background & Overview
Background & Objective

• Lack of systematic information on implementation of TF measures
  – Dec. 2013: 2nd Global Forum on Trade Facilitation highlight need for more / better information on implementation of TF measures, in particular paperless trade measures
  – Oct. 2014: UNRCs initiate first Global Survey on TF & Paperless Trade Implementation
    • in collaboration with OECD, UNCTAD, ITC and sub-regional organizations

• Objective: “to enable countries to better understand and monitor progress on implementation of TF, including paperless trade measures; to support evidence-based policy making, and highlight capacity building and technical assistance needs”
Survey Scope

- Goes beyond the scope of the TF measures included in the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA)

- **38 TF measures covered (4 groups):**
  1. General TF measures
  2. Paperless trade
  3. Cross-border paperless trade
  4. Transit facilitation

[ General TF measures, transit facilitation measures + some paperless trade measures related to WTO TFA provisions ]
## Survey Scope

### General TF Measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Question No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trade facilitation measure (and question no.) in survey questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Transparency
- 2. Publication of existing import-export regulations on the Internet
- 3. Stakeholder consultation on new draft regulations
- 4. Advance publication/notification of new regulations before their implementation
- 5. Advance ruling
- 9. Independent appeal mechanism

#### Formalities
- 6. Risk management
- 7. Pre-arrival processing
- 8. Post-clearance audit
- 10. Separation of release from final determination of duties, taxes, fees and charges
- 11. Establishment and publication of average release times
- 12. Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators
- 13. Expedited shipments
- 14. Acceptance of paper or electronic copies

#### Institutional arrangement and cooperation
- 1. Establishment of a national trade facilitation committee
- 31. Cooperation between agencies on the ground at the national level
- 32. Government agencies delegating controls to Customs authorities
- 33. Alignment of working days and hours with neighbouring countries at border crossings
- 34. Alignment of formalities and procedure with neighbouring countries at border crossings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trade facilitation measure (and question no.) in survey questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paperless trade</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Electronic/automated Customs System established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Internet connection available for Customs and other trade control agencies at border-crossings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Electronic Single Window System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Electronic submission of Customs declarations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Electronic Application and Issuance of Trade Licenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Electronic Submission of Sea Cargo Manifests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Electronic Application and Issuance of Preferential Certificate of Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. E-Payment of Customs Duties and Fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Electronic Application for Customs Refunds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cross-border paperless trade</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Laws and regulations for electronic transactions are in place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Recognized certification authority issuing digital certificates to traders for electronic transactions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Engagement of the country in trade-related cross-border electronic data exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Certificate of origin electronically exchanged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Sanitary and Phytosanitary (SPS) Certificate electronically exchanged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Banks and insurers retrieving letters of credit electronically without paper-based documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transit Facilitation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Transit facilitation agreement(s) with neighbouring countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Customs Authorities limit the physical inspections of transit goods and use of risk assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Supporting pre-arrival processing for trade facilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Cooperation between agencies of countries involved in transit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Collection Methodology

- Standard 3-step process:

**Step 1:** Data submission by experts (*Sept – Mar 2014*) - survey forms disseminated by UNRCs to experts from governments, private sector and/or academia

**Step 2:** Data verification by UNRCs (*Oct 2014–Apr 2015*) - Staff from UNRCs cross-checked collected data and augmented it through desk research and data sharing among UNRCs and survey partners

**Step 3:** Data verification by governments (*Apr – May 2015*) - Unified country data sent to national government or representatives to ensure that countries have the opportunity to review the dataset and provide additional information

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Data Collection Methodology

- Each UNRC adapted this standard 3-step process to its own situation and context.

- Each measure ultimately rated as “fully implemented”, “partially implemented”, “on a pilot basis”, or “not implemented”.

- For maximum transparency, the data is/will be made available online and additional inputs / information on implementation status of any measures as of May 2015 may be incorporated at any time.
Results / Findings

• Data could be collected from **111 countries**
  – ECA: 26 African countries
  – ECE: 13 European countries
  – ECLAC: 17 Latin American & Caribbean countries
  – ESCAP: 44 Asia-Pacific countries
  – ESCWA: 11 Western Asia/Middle East countries

• Insufficient data from many countries on *cross-border paperless trade*, as well as some *paperless trade* measures.
  → Global overview of results based on 22 (of 38) TF measures included in the survey, and 102 countries (for which data for all 22 measures was available).
Trade facilitation implementation around the World (Cross-border paperless trade excluded)

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Implementation of different categories of TF measures in 7 World Regions

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Least implemented trade facilitation measures around the World
(Cross-border paperless trade and transit measures excluded)

• Establishment and publication of average release times
  (South Asia, Latin America)
  • Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators
    (Middle east and North Africa)
  • Electronic Single Window System
    (Pacific)

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Formalities

- Acceptance of paper or electronic copies of supporting documents required for import, export or transit formalities
- Pre-arrival processing
- Post-clearance audit
- Separation of Release from final determination of customs duties, taxes, fees and charges
- Establishment and publication of average release times
- Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Institutionalization & Cooperation

Cooperation between agencies on the ground at the national level

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Transparency

Publication of existing import-export regulations on the internet

Stakeholder consultation on new draft regulations (prior to their finalization)

Advance publication/notification of new regulation before their implementation

Advance ruling (on tariff classification)

Independent appeal mechanism

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Paperless Trade

Electronic/automated Customs System

- 100%
- 50%
- 0%

E-Payment of Customs Duties and Fees

Electronic Submission of Air Cargo Manifests

Electronic Application and Issuance of Trade Licenses

Electronic submission of Customs declarations

Internet connection available to Customs and other trade control agencies at border-crossings

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
Single Window (electronic)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Fully Implemented</th>
<th>Partially Implemented</th>
<th>Pilot Stage of Implementation</th>
<th>Not Implemented</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>East Asia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Asia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East and North Africa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developed Economies</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ Excluding Greece and Sweden (because of DKs) \]
Global Survey on Trade Facilitation and Paperless Trade Implementation 2015

The United Nations Regional Commissions (UNRCs) including ECA, ECE, ECLAC, ESCAP and ESCWA, in collaboration with UNCTAD, OECD, ITC, OIC and SELA, have conducted a global survey to collect relevant data and information on trade facilitation and paperless trade implementation in their respective member states. Outcomes of the survey are expected to enable the countries to better understand and monitor progress in trade facilitation, support evidence-based policy-making, and highlight the needs for capacity building and technical assistance.

The global survey represents a key initiative under the framework of the Joint UNRC Approach to Trade Facilitation, agreed upon in Beirut, January 2010, to enable the five UNRCs to present a joint global view on key trade facilitation issues. The questionnaire for the global survey was jointly prepared and finalized by UNRCs and OECD and is available here. The survey results and data collected are made available below.

Report and Data

Africa
Asia and the Pacific
Latin America and the Caribbean
Western Asia

Global Report
Countries Report

Source:
unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
The level of implementation of trade facilitation measures in Thailand (89.9%) is above the level in Asia-Pacific (46.5%). It also extends the level of implementation in South-East Asia (60%). Among the five core groups of trade facilitation measures, the most implemented in Thailand are "Paperless trade" measures (95.9%). The least implemented are "Institutional arrangement and cooperation" measures (44.4%) and "Cross-border paperless trade" measures (44.4%).

Implementation of "Transparency" measures is above the regional average but below the sub-regional average. The measures least implemented in this area in Thailand are stakeholder consultations on draft regulations, advance publication of regulations before implementation, advancement, and independent appeal mechanisms. Implementation of improved "Formalities" is higher than both the regional and sub-regional averages. The least implemented measures in this area are risk management, Pre-arrival processing, and Publication of an advance release times.

In "Paperless trade", Thailand's implementation is above both the regional and sub-regional averages. E-Certificate of Origin is least implemented.

Thailand may focus its trade facilitation efforts in particular on full implementation of "Institutional arrangement and cooperation" measures, as well as on moving towards "Cross-border paperless trade".

Disclaimer: The data presented here is for policy research and development purposes only and should not be construed as statements of legal, or political, views or facts. For more information, please visit [https://unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp](https://unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp).
Conclusions & Way Forward

• First joint UNRC Global Survey on TF implementation provides data on **100+ countries**
• In most regions, WTO TFA-related implementation levels > **50%**
  – AEO programmes, Single Window and Publication of Release times least implemented
• Publication of **Global** report and dataset in July/Aug.
• Second Survey to begin at the end of this year – **additional partners welcome**

Source: [unnex.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp](unnex.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp)
Step-by-Step Trade Facilitation:
Cumulative Implementation scores of 4 core groups of trade facilitation measures in different world’s region

Source: unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSurvey2015.asp
THANK YOU!!!
ANNEX
### Annex 1: Definition of the different stages of implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition of stage of implementation</th>
<th>Coding/Scoring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Full implementation:</strong> the trade facilitation measure implemented is in full compliance with commonly accepted international standards, recommendations and conventions (such as the Revised Kyoto Convention, UN/CEFACT Recommendations, or the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement); it is implemented in law and in practice; it is available to essentially all relevant stakeholders nationwide, supported by adequate legal and institutional framework, as well as adequate infrastructure and financial and human resources.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Partial implementation:</strong> a measure is considered to be partially implemented if at least one of the following is true: (1) the trade facilitation measure is not in full compliance with commonly accepted international standards, recommendations and conventions; (2) the country is still in the process of rolling out the implementation of measure; (3) the measure is practiced on an unsustainable, short-term or ad-hoc basis; (4) the measure is not implemented in all targeted locations (such as key border crossing stations); or (5) not all targeted stakeholders are fully involved.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pilot stage of implementation:</strong> A measure is considered to be at the pilot stage of implementation if, in addition to meeting the general attributes of partial implementation, it is available only to (or at) a very small portion of the intended stakeholder group (location) and/or is being implemented on a trial basis. When a new trade facilitation measure is under pilot stage of implementation, the old measure is often continuously used in parallel to ensure the service is provided in case of disruption of new measure. This stage of implementation also includes relevant rehearsals and preparation for the full-fledged implementation.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Not implemented:</strong> simply means a trade facilitation measure has not been implemented. However, this stage does not rule out initiatives or efforts towards implementation of the measure. For example, under this stage, (pre)feasibility or planning of implementation can be carried out; and consultation with stakeholders on the implementation may be arranged.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Country groups for Global Analysis

⇒ **TOAL: 102 countries grouped as follows (based on WB groupings):**

- **East Asia (14):** Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, China, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Mongolia, Myanmar, Philippines, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Thailand, Timor Leste, Viet Nam;
- **Central Asia (8):** Armenia, Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russian Federation, Tajikistan, Turkey, Uzbekistan;
- **South Asia (8):** Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan, Sri Lanka;
- **Pacific (11):** Fiji, Micronesia, Kiribati, Nauru, Palau, Papua New Guinea, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu, Vanuatu;
- **Latin America and the Caribbean (17):** Barbados, Bolivia, E.P., Brasil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, México, Nicaragua, Paraguay, Perú, República Dominicana, Suriname, Uruguay;
- **Middle East and North Africa (10):** Djibouti, Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, Libya, Palestine, Qatar, Sudan, United Arab Emirates, Yemen;
- **Sub-Saharan Africa (22):** Benin, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Comoros, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Kenya, Lesotho, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Namibia, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Tanzania, Togo, Uganda, Zimbabwe;
- **Developed economies (12):** Australia, Austria, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Japan, Netherlands, New Zealand, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland.
Background

• Trade facilitation (TF) a long-standing area of work in UN Regional Commissions
  – UNECE and UN/CEFACT (UN Centre for Trade Facilitation and e-Business) active since the 1970’s
  • Key role in developing standards for TF and electronic information exchange

---

Paperless Trade?
- The use of electronic data and documents in trade procedures (instead of paper documents) / Application of modern information and communication technologies (ICT) to trade procedures
- Today an important/essential part of trade facilitation

Cross-border paperless trade?
- The exchange of electronic trade-data and documents between public or private stakeholders located in different countries.
Background

• Growing interest in TF and paperless trade since the late 1990’s
  – ESCAP launch dedicated TF programme (2001)
  – UNNExT: ESCAP-ECE Network of Experts for Paperless Trade in Asia and the Pacific (2009)
  – UNRCs Joint Approach to Trade Facilitation launched (2011)
    • [In support of the WTO negotiations on TF]
  – ESCAP Resolution on Enabling Paperless Trade (2012)
  – Negotiations of a Regional Agreement for the Facilitation of Cross-Border Paperless Trade (since April 2014)
Outline

1. Background
2. Survey Scope
3. Data Collection Methodology
4. Findings: Global Overview
5. Conclusions & Way Forward
### SECTION B – TRADE FACILITATION MEASURES

(Please indicate the correct response by putting an X in the relevant column for each measure, depending on its level of implementation in your country)

**FI:** Fully Implemented  ;  **PI:** Partially Implemented;  **PS:** Pilot Stage of Implementation;  **NI:** Not implemented;  **DK:** Don’t know

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Trade Facilitation Measures</th>
<th>FI</th>
<th>PI</th>
<th>PS</th>
<th>NI</th>
<th>DK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Establishment of a national trade facilitation committee or similar body</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Does the committee include executive authority, border agencies and Private sector stakeholders?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ ] Yes  [ ] No  [ ] Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Has the committee established terms of reference and procedures for the conduct of its activities?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[ ] Yes  [ ] No  [ ] Don’t know</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Are sufficient and qualified staff available to support the committee?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please specify progress or improvement made over the past 12 months

Further information (e.g., website, date of implementation...)